

東洋大学学術情報リポジトリ Toyo University Repository for Academic Resources

An Annotated Translation of Sutra Passages 62 & 63 in Chapter 2 of the Vyakhyayukti: “Speaking and Listening” as Means towards the Construction of a Basis for Multicultural Coexistence

著者	Horiuchi Toshio
journal or publication title	Journal of International Philosophy
number	2
page range	355-368
year	2013-03
URL	http://id.nii.ac.jp/1060/00005307/

An Annotated Translation of Sūtra Passages 62 & 63 in Chapter 2 of the *Vyākhyāyukti*: “Speaking and Listening” as Means towards the Construction of a Basis for Multicultural Coexistence¹

Horiuchi Toshio

1. Introduction

It should go without saying that a prerequisite for multicultural coexistence² is first of all the ability to listen carefully to each other and understand each other. The same applies to interreligious dialogue. As is indicated by the statement in one early Buddhist text that “the gathering is well disciplined without stick or weapon,”³ it is evident that, in addition to his personal charisma, Śākyamuni’s instruction of others was based on his extremely persuasive sermons, as a result of which many followers of other religions abandoned their own views and gathered around him. Although this is an example of instruction and guidance rather than coexistence and dialogue, Śākyamuni is said to have been skilled at adapting his sermons to the needs and capacities of his listeners, and there have survived numerous accounts of moving episodes concerning his sermons. At the same time, the importance of listening to the teachings is also evident from the fact that the three disciplines of hearing, thinking, and practising form, in this order, a basic system of religious cultivation in Buddhism.

For this reason the stance to be adopted when preaching and listening to the Dharma, or teaching, was an issue already during Śākyamuni’s lifetime. The sūtra passages taken up in this article deal with this question, and in addition the Vinaya includes rules concerning the etiquette to be observed when preaching the Dharma.⁴ It is stipulated, for example, that the Dharma must not be taught to someone who, though not sick, is using a parasol. This was because such behaviour was deemed to be ill-mannered and lacking in a sense of respect for the Dharma.⁵ The etiquette for preaching and listening to the Dharma is also described in systematic detail in later Mahāyāna treatises, partly perhaps because of the importance attached to teachers of the Dharma (*dharma-bhāṇaka*).

In this article I take up the *Vyākhyāyukti* (The Logic of Exegesis) by the Indian scholar-monk Vasubandhu (ca. A.D. 400), a treatise explaining how to interpret Buddhist scriptures, and I present a critical edition and annotated translation of Vasubandhu’s commentary on two sūtra passages in chapter 2 dealing with the question of how to preach and listen to the Dharma. It seems to me that this section is thought-provoking not only with regard to the question of how to expound and listen to the Buddhist teachings, but also in connection with the broader issue of the relationship between teachers and pupils. Accordingly, I wish to offer this section as a source for constructing an “intellectual” basis, or rather a “practical” basis, for multicultural coexistence in the sphere of speaking and listening. In addition, since almost none of chapter 2 of the *Vyākhyāyukti* has been translated into any modern language, the following should also have some value as textual source material.

2. The *Vyākhyāyukti*

Reference should be made to my earlier study (Horiuchi 2009) regarding the history of research on the *Vyākhyāyukti*, and here I wish to mention only some studies that I was unable to include in that book. An annotated translation of the *Buddhānusmṛti-tīkā*, attributed to Vasubandhu, has been published by Nakamikado Keikyō (2008) and Fujinaka Kōji (2008), and it has been pointed out that the interpretation presented in this work is virtually identical with the interpretation of scriptural phrases relating to “Buddha” given at the start of chapter 2 of the *Vyākhyāyukti*.

The *Vyākhyāyukti* is divided into five chapters in the Tibetan translation, and there have appeared two doctoral dissertations presenting translations of the entire first chapter. Hakamaya Noriaki (1982) had previously suggested that there were links between the *Vyākhyāyukti* and the **Vyākhyāsaṃgrahaṇī*, and this has now been corroborated by these two dissertations. The dissertation submitted by Richard Nance to the University of Chicago in May 2004 has now been published (Nance 2012). In addition to a translation of chapter 1 of the *Vyākhyāyukti*, it also includes translations of the *Abhidharmasamuccayabhāṣya* and **Vyākhyāsaṃgrahaṇī*. The dissertation submitted by Ueno (Hitomi) Makio to Ōtani University in 2009 elucidates the methods of scriptural commentary set out in the *Vyākhyāyukti* through a comparison with other related texts. It too includes an annotated translation of chapter 1 of the *Vyākhyāyukti*, and I am grateful to the author for having provided me with a PDF file. When identifying the many texts quoted in this chapter, Ueno also pays attention to the latest research on the Āgamas, and by presenting Sanskrit reconstructions whenever appropriate he has been able to provide a more accurate translation than Nance, but regrettably his dissertation remains unpublished. He has, however, published excerpts of his annotated translation (Ueno 2010) and is preparing a sequel.⁶

Next, I wish to touch on the text of the *Vyākhyāyukti*. It was originally written in Sanskrit, but the Sanskrit original has not survived, nor was it translated into Chinese, and there is only a Tibetan translation. A critical edition of the full Tibetan text has been published by Lee Jong-Choel (2001). The first such undertaking, it is divided, by and large appropriately, into sections on the basis of Lee’s own understanding and is of great benefit to researchers. It is not, however, entirely without problems regarding his understanding of the content and also contains misprints. The text probably needs to be thoroughly reedited with reference to Guṇamati’s commentary (*Vyākhyāyukti-tīkā*) and on the basis of a careful investigation of other related texts, and it also needs to be translated into a modern language. The present article represents one step towards this end.

3. Sūtra Passages 62 & 63 in Chapter 2 of the *Vyākhyāyukti*

In addition to the *Vyākhyāyukti*, Vasubandhu also compiled a work called the *Sūtrakhaṇḍaśata*, a collection of 103 excerpts from Buddhist scriptures. The figure “103” is based on Lee’s edition, which I here follow. Accordingly, “sūtra passage 62” refers to the 62nd of these sūtra passages in chapter 2, which in turn consists of Vasubandhu’s commentary on phrases in these passages included in the *Sūtrakhaṇḍaśata*. As a result, not only are we apprised of a considerable number of the canonical texts with which Vasubandhu was familiar, but this chapter is also interesting on account of Vasubandhu’s explications of Buddhist terminology.

The question of the order in which the sūtra passages in chapter 2 have been arranged is one that remains unresolved but merits further investigation. Did Vasubandhu select the 103 sūtra passages at random without any special intent, or does their order have some special significance and reflect some sort of system? A rough classification was undertaken by Yamaguchi Susumu (1959: 177–178), but for a more detailed analysis it will be necessary to gain a full grasp of chapter 2 as a whole. As far as the section taken up here is concerned, sūtra

passages 62–67 may perhaps constitute a single grouping. Teaching and listening to the Dharma is also the main topic of chapter 5 of the *Vyākhyāyukti*.

Another question that will need to be considered in the future is whether the phrase “in an *āgama* (*lung*, tradition, canonical text)” frequently appearing in the *Vyākhyāyukti* refers to a specific text or to an oral tradition. In the case of both sūtra passages taken up below, interpretations from an *āgama* are adduced, prefaced by the phrase “in an *āgama*,” when commenting on the passages in question. To date I have been unable to identify the sources of these passages, but in the case of sūtra passage 64, for instance, an interpretation more or less coinciding with the **Vyākhyāsamgrahaṇī* (D 1 49a) of the *Yogācārabhūmi* is cited as an *āgama*. Likewise, it is worth noting that with regard to sūtra passage 75 too a passage for which a parallel can be found in the *Śrāvakaḥmī* (“Fourth *Yogasthāna*,” Shukla ed., 501) is cited with the prefatory remark “in a credible (*yid ches pa*) tradition” when commenting on the term *abhisamaya*.

In sūtra passage 62 it is stated that one should speak to others in twenty ways, while in sūtra passage 63 it is stated that one should listen to the Dharma in sixteen ways. Both passages are taken up again in chapter 5 as the words of Śāriputra. As has been pointed out by Peter Skilling (2000), the source of both passages is the *Arthavistara* (for which there is no Pāli parallel but which corresponds to the *Guangyi famen jing* and *Pufayi jing* in Chinese translation; see Hartman 2004). In this sūtra the twenty ways of speaking are immediately followed by the sixteen ways of listening, and the *āgamas* cited in the *Sūtrakhaṇḍasāta* can be attributed to differences in translators. In addition, twenty ways of preaching the Dharma are listed in the *Śrāvakaḥmī* (ŚrBh I: 224) and *Bodhisattvabhūmi*, as well as being touched on in the *Vyākhyāsamgrahaṇī*, and the Sanskrit equivalents can be posited on the basis of the former two texts.

Annotated Translation of Sūtra Passages 62 & 63 in Chapter 2 of the *Vyākhyāyukti*

[Sūtra 62]

“Venerable sirs, when a preaching monk delivers a sermon, he should speak to others in these twenty ways. He should speak (1) at an opportune time, (2) respectfully, (3) in order, (4) in connection, (5) consistently, (6) gladdeningly, (7) pleasingly, (8) satisfyingly, (9) not praisingly, (10) not censuringly, (11) according to reason, (12) together, (13) unmixedly, (14) according to the Dharma, (15) just like the assembly, (16) with a mind of loving-kindness, (17) with a mind of beneficence, (18) with a mind of compassion, (19) not relying on gain, respect, or fame, and (20) neither praising himself nor belittling others.”⁷ He should speak in these twenty ways.”⁸

The above is a sūtra passage.

[Interpretation I]

Here, “(1) at an opportune time (**kālena*)” is knowing that [the listener] is someone wishing to listen and someone worth explaining to, like *Veṇukātyāyanasagotrī*.⁹ “(2) Respectfully (**satkṛya*)” is not belittling, like a lion pouncing.¹⁰ “(3) In order (**anupūrvam*)” is starting with [sermons about] giving and so on,¹¹ which should be done first,¹² and excellent¹³ sermons. “(4) In connection (**anusamdhim*)” is with regard to interpreting the sūtras.¹⁴

“(5) Consistently (**anusahitam*)” is with regard to the reply to a question,¹⁵ because in conclusive replies and so on one replies thus.¹⁶ “(6) Gladdeningly (**harṣayat*)” is to those who have faith. “(7) Pleasingly (**rocayat*)” is to those in a prior state¹⁷ and those who are hostile (**pratihata*). “(8) Satisfyingly (**toṣayat*)” is to those who have doubts. “(9) Not praisingly (**an-utsāhayat*),” “(10) not censuringly (**anavasādayat*)”¹⁸ are like saying “all those like these have entered upon the right [path]” or saying “they have entered upon the wrong [path],” as is stated in the

**Araṇavibhāga-sūtra*.¹⁹ If someone who does not understand the particularities of those who are to be tamed (i.e., instructed) acts thus [praising and censuring], those who are not to be tamed thereby become angry.²⁰

“(11) According to reason (**yuktām*)” is because it is not contrary to a valid means of cognition.²¹ “(12) Together (**sahitām*)” is because the former and latter [parts of the sermon] are connected. “(13) Unmixedly (**avyavakīrṇām*)” is because the sermon refrains from wandering elsewhere. “(14) According to the Dharma (**dhārmikīm*)” is because it follows what is good. “(15) Just like the assembly (**yathāparṣat*)” is because it conforms with those who are to be tamed.

“(16) With a mind of loving-kindness (**maitracitta*)” is because one wishes that the listener will be happy. “(17) With a mind of beneficence (**hitacitta*)” is because one wishes that he will have no mental afflictions. “(18) With a mind of compassion (**anukampācitta*)” is because one wishes that he will have no suffering. Furthermore [with regard to (16)–(18)],²² they are, in order, towards those facing what is good and what is not good and those who are neither²³ with a mind of “(16) loving-kindness” and so on. “(19) Not relying on gain, respect, or fame (**aniśrito lābhasatkāraśloke*)” is because one refrains from wishing for them. “(20) Neither praising himself nor belittling others (**na cātmānam utkarṣayati, na parān paṃsayati*)” is because the speaker refrains from desiring excessive trust²⁴ in himself.

If it is so, it has been explained in five ways each²⁵ 1) how, 2) why, 3) similar to what, and 4) by similarity to what a sermon is to be given.

[Interpretation II]

In an *āgama* it says:

“Twenty kinds of speech as remedies for eleven faults.”

The eleven faults are: [1] the fault of speaking to someone who is not a [proper] vessel, [2] the fault of not completing an utterance, [3] the fault of discontinuing an utterance, [4] the fault of not making [the listener] understand an utterance, [5] the fault of an utterance not being respected, [6] the fault of saying something the meaning of which is inadmissible,²⁶ [7] the fault of saying something that is not of the field [of discourse] (**gocara*), [8] the fault of speaking while agitated, [9] the fault of saying something meaningless, [10] the fault of saying something inappropriate,²⁷ and [11] the fault of speaking with afflicted thoughts.²⁸

Here, “[1] someone who is not a [proper] vessel” is being ill-mannered. As a remedy for “[3] the fault of discontinuing an utterance,” it should be known that it is the three ways of [speaking] “(3) in order” and so on²⁹ in terms of teaching, words of argument, and words of reply. As a remedy for “[4] the fault of not making [the listener] understand an utterance,” there are the sixth, seventh, and eighth [ways of speaking] in terms of someone who has faith, someone who is hostile, and someone who is in between³⁰ [respectively]. As a remedy for “[5] the fault of an utterance not being respected,” there is the twosome of the ninth and the tenth [ways of speaking], because although one should not praise someone who is evil-acting, even if one censures one lapses into the fault of not honouring him. By “[7] that which is not the field [of discourse]” is [expounding] the profound meaning to someone of inferior capacity.³¹ There are three kinds of “[11] afflicted thoughts”: with (i) thoughts of being trusted, (ii) thoughts of causing faith and respect,³² and (iii) thoughts of jealousy (*īrṣyā*).³³ As a remedy for the first [thought] there are the modes of the mind of “(16) loving-kindness, (17) beneficence, and (18) compassion,”³⁴ and by means of thinking whereby *nirvāṇa* and the path to it are to be understood and thinking whereby the meaning of what has been explained is to be comprehended.³⁵

[Interpretation III]

Furthermore, in summary, in this [sūtra] it should be known that, with regard to 1) connections of a talk, 2) actions of a talk, 3) virtues of a talk, and 4) virtues of a speaker, there are five [kinds for each].

[Sutra 63]

“Venerable sirs, he who wishes to listen to the Dharma should listen in sixteen ways. Namely, (1) he should listen to the Dharma at an opportune time, (2) with respect, (3) wishing to listen, (4) without complaining, (5) compliantly, (6) without looking for an argument, (7) establishing respect for the Dharma, (8) establishing respect for the Dharma-preacher, (9) without belittling the Dharma, (10) without belittling the Dharma-preacher, (11) without belittling himself, (12) with a mind that wishes to know fully, (13) with a one-pointed mind, (14) giving ear, (15) concentrating the mind, and (16) wholeheartedly he should listen to the Dharma, O venerable sirs.” In these sixteen ways he should listen to the Dharma.”

The above is a sūtra passage.

[Interpretation I]

It should be known that the sixteen ways [of listening] are remedies for thirteen faults. The thirteen faults are: [1] the fault of imposing oneself³⁶ upon the speaker and in behaviour, [2] the fault of haughtiness, [3] the fault of not seeking, [4] the fault of being angry at [another's] taking of another position,³⁷ [5] the fault of not accepting the speaker[’s words] because of a lack of respect, [6] the fault of the thought of making captious objections,³⁸ [7] the fault of not honouring by not paying attention to the Dharma and the Dharma-preacher, [8] the fault of belittling by paying attention to faults [of the Dharma and the Dharma-preacher], [9] the fault of disparagement, [10] the fault of being desirous of gain and respect, [11] the fault of not listening because of the twosome of distraction and contraction [of the mind], [12] the fault of not properly paying attention, and [13] the fault of not fully paying attention.

Here, [1] there is the first fault because [the listener] is ill-mannered when [the speaker] has withdrawn.³⁹ There is “[2] the fault of haughtiness” because there arises pride that one is of a lineage superior [to that of the speaker]. “[7] To the Dharma” means that there are virtue, eloquence, and great reward [in the Dharma]. “[7] To the Dharma-preacher” is to a spiritual friend.⁴⁰ “[8] Fault in the Dharma” is in the disconnectedness between words and letters. “[8] To the Dharma-preacher”⁴¹ is to imperfections of behaviour, lineage, appearance (*ākṛti), words, and articulation.⁴² “[11] Distraction” is that the mind wanders elsewhere. “[11] Contraction” is that the mind is depressed because of torpidity (*styāna) and drowsiness (*middha). “[12] Not properly paying attention” is by being mistaken about intent and Dharma-nature. “[13] Not fully paying attention” is because of weakness in desire (*chanda)⁴³ and mental effort (*ābhoga).⁴⁴

[Interpretation II]

In an āgama it says:

“There are sixteen kinds [of listening] as remedies for six kinds of faults.”

The six faults are: [1] the fault of action, [2] the fault of indifference, [3] the fault of disrespect, [4] the fault of thinking, [5] the fault of incongruity, and [6] the fault of grasping.

There are three kinds of “[1] the fault of action”: (i) the fault of physical action is being ill-mannered; (ii) the fault of physical and verbal action is on account of not exhorting by means of both; and (iii) the fault of mental action is on account of not wishing to listen.⁴⁵

“[4] The fault of thinking” is on account of looking for an argument with others and thinking that one will be liberated by arguing in this manner.

There are five kinds of “[5] the fault of incongruity”:⁴⁶ (i) disrespect towards the Dharma on account of understanding that it is not deliverance,⁴⁷ (ii) belittlement because of disconnectedness between words and letters, (iii) disrespect towards a person because of faults in behaviour, words, and articulation, (iv) belittlement because of a fault in lineage, and (v) self-deprecation in a person who thinks that the capacity to understand and

practise [the teachings] will not arise [in himself].

There are also five kinds of “[6] the fault of grasping”:⁴⁸ (i) erroneous grasping, (ii) not grasping the meaning, (iii) not grasping the letters, (iv) not grasping clearly (correctly), and (v) not grasping without remainder.

The rest are not explained because they are easy to understand.

Abbreviations

Arthvī: *Arthavistara*. D No. 318, P No. 984.

BBh: *Bodhisattvabhūmi*, ed. U. Wogiwara, Tokyo, 1930–36.

D: Sde dge edition of Tibetan Tripiṭaka.

L: See Lee 2001.

P: Peking edition of Tibetan Tripiṭaka.

ŚrBh I: *Yugaron, Shōmonji, Daiichi yugasho—Sansukurittogo tekisuto to wayaku* 瑜伽論 声聞地 第一瑜伽処—サンスクリット語テキストと和訳— (*Śrāvaka bhūmi: Revised Sanskrit Text and Japanese Translation*), ed. Taishō Daigaku Sōgō Bukkyō Kenkyūjo Shōmonji Kenkyūkai 大正大学総合仏教研究所声聞地研究会, Tokyo: Sankibō Busshorin 山喜房佛書林, 1998.

Sūsa: Vasubandhu, *Sūtrakhaṇḍasāta = Vyākhyāyukti-sūtrakhaṇḍasāta* (*rNam par bshad pa'i rigs pa'i mdo sde'i dum bu brgya*). D No. 4060 (Śi), P No. 5561 (Si).

T: *Taishō shinshū daizōkyō* 大正新脩大藏經.

VyY: Vasubandhu, *Vyākhyāyukti*. D No. 4061 (Śi), P No. 5562 (Si); cf. Lee 2001.

VyYT: Guṇamati, *Vyākhyāyukti-ṭīkā*. D No. 4069 (Si), P No. 5570 (I).

Guangyi famen jing 広義法門經: T 1, No. 97 (translated by Paramārtha [Zhendi 真諦] during Chen 陳 dynasty).

Pufayi jing 普法義經: T 1, No. 98 (translated by An Shigao 安世高 during Later Han 後漢).

(For other abbreviations, reference should be made to Horiuchi 2009).

Bibliography

Chung, Jin-il. 2008. *A survey of the Sanskrit fragments corresponding to the Chinese Saṃyuktāgama* 雜阿含經相当梵文断片一覧. Tokyo: Sankibō Busshorin 山喜房佛書林.

Fujinaka Kōji 藤仲孝司. 2008. “Seshin-saku *Butsuzuinen kōchū* wayaku kenkyū, kōhan bubun: Daijō tokuyū no nenbutsukan” 世親作『仏随念広註』和訳研究 後半部分・大乘特有の念仏観 [An annotated modern Japanese translation of the *Buddhānusmṛti-ṭīkā* by Vasubandhu, second half: Recollection of the Buddha proper to the Mahāyāna]. *Bukkyō Daigaku Sōgō Kenkyūjo Kiyō* 佛教大学総合研究所紀要 15: 131–152.

Hakamaya Noriaki 袴谷憲昭. 1982. “Yugagyō-ha no bunken” 瑜伽行派の文献 [Works of the Yogācāra school]. In *Kōza Daijō Bukkyō 8: yuishiki shisō* 講座・大乘仏教 8 唯識思想 [Lecture series on Mahāyāna Buddhism 8: *Vijñaptimātratā* thought], 44–76. Tokyo: Shunjūsha 春秋社. (Repr. in id., *Yuishiki shisō ronkō* 唯識思想論考 [Collected essays on *vijñaptimātratā* thought], Tokyo: Daizō Shuppan 大蔵出版, 2001.)

Hartman, Jens-Uwe. 2004. “Contents and Structure of the *Dirghāgama* of the (Mūla-)Sarvāstivādins.” *Sōka Daigaku Kokusai Bukkyōgaku Kōtō Kenkyūjo Nenpō* 創価大学国際仏教学高等研究所年報 (*Annual Report of The International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhism at Soka University*) 7: 119–137.

Hirakawa Akira 平川彰. 1995. *Nihyakugojukkai no kenkyū* 二百五十戒の研究 [A study of the 250 precepts], vol. 4. Tokyo: Shunjūsha 春秋社.

Horiuchi Toshio 堀内俊郎. 2009. *Seshin no Daijō bussetsu ron—“Shakukiron” daiyonshō o chūshin ni* 世親の大乘仏説論—『釈軌論』第四章を中心に (*Vasubandhu's Proof of the Authenticity of the Mahāyāna as Found in the Fourth Chapter of His Vyākhyāyukti*). Bibliotheca Indologica et Buddhologica 13. Tokyo: Sankibō Busshorin 山喜房佛書林.

———. 2011. “Bukkyō ni okeru kyōsei no kanōsei to shite no ‘sha’ (upekṣā)” 仏教における共生の可能性としての「捨 (upekṣā)」 (*Upekṣā as a Potential Basis for Kyōsei in Buddhism*). *Kokusai Tetsugaku Kenkyū* 国際哲学研究 (*Journal of International Philosophy*) 1: 129–135 (281–288).

Lee, Jong-Choel. 2001. *The Tibetan Text of the Vyākhyāyukti of Vasubandhu*. Bibliotheca Indologica et Buddhologica 8. Tokyo: The Sankibo Press.

Nakamikado Keikyō 中御門敬教. 2008. “Seshin-saku *Butsuzuinen kōchū* wayaku kenkyū, zenhan bubun: butsu jūgō ni motozuku sanjō kyōtsū no nenbutsukan” 世親作『仏随念広註』和訳研究 前半部分・仏十号に基づく三乗共通の念仏観 [An annotated modern Japanese translation of the *Buddhānusmṛti-ṭīkā* by Vasubandhu, first half: Recollection of the Buddha,

common to the Three Vehicles, based on the ten epithets of the Buddha]. *Bukkyō Daigaku Sōgō Kenkyūjo Kiyō* 佛教大学総合研究所紀要 15: 105–130.

- Nance, Richard. 2012. *Speaking for Buddhas: Scriptural Commentary in Indian Buddhism*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Saitō Akira 斎藤明 et al., co-eds. 2011. “*Kusharon*” o *chūshin* to *shita goi shichijūgohō no teigiteki yōreishū*—*Bukkyō yōgo no yōreishū (bauddakōsha) oyobi gendai kijun yakugoshū* 『俱舍論』を中心とした五位七十五法の定義的用例集—仏教用語の用例集 (パウツダコーシャ) および現代基準訳語集 (*Bauddhakośa: A Treasury of Buddhist Terms and Illustrative Sentences*), vol. 1. Bibliotheca Indologica et Buddhologica 14. Tokyo: Sankibō Busshorin 山喜房佛書林.
- Skilling, Peter. 2000. “Vasubandhu and the *Vyākhyāyukti* Literature.” *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 23-2: 297–350.
- Ueno (Hitomi) Makio 上野(人見)牧生. 2010. “*Shakukiron* ni okeru Agon kyōten no gogi kaishakuhō” 『釈軌論』における阿含經典の語義解釈法 [The method of interpreting the meanings of words from the Āgamas in the *Vyākhyāyukti*], pt. 1. *Indo Tetsugaku Bukkyōgaku* 印度哲学仏教学 (*Hokkaido Journal of Indological and Buddhist Studies*) 25, (71)–(84).
- Yamaguchi Susumu 山口益. 1959. “Seshin no Shakukiron ni tsuite” 世親の釈軌論について [On Vasubandhu’s *Vyākhyāyukti*]. *Nihon Bukkyō Gakkai Nenpō* 日本仏教学会年報 25. (Repr. in id., *Yamaguchi Susumu Bukkyōgaku bunshū* 山口益仏教学文集 [Collected essays on Buddhist studies by Yamaguchi Susumu], vol. 2, Tokyo: Shunjūsha 春秋社, 1973.)

Notes

- 1 This study was supported by a Grant-in-Aid for Young Scientists (B) (KAKENHI no. 23720024).
- 2 On a previous occasion (Horiuchi 2011) I argued that, were one to seek in Buddhism a basis for “symbiosis” or “coexistence” (*kyōsei* 共生) in the sense proposed by Shiio Benkyō 椎尾弁匡 and Kurokawa Kishō 黒川紀章, one possible candidate might be *upekṣā*.
- 3 MN 89, *Dhammacetiya-sutta*.
- 4 The number of such rules varies depending on the version of the Vinaya. For details, see Hirakawa 1995: 571ff.
- 5 Hirakawa 1995: 574.
- 6 Since Ueno’s dissertation has already been submitted, it would be more helpful, I believe, if it were published in its entirety as a single volume.
- 7 Passages enclosed in angle brackets have been supplemented from the *Sūtrakhaṇḍasāta*. In n. 7 the corresponding Sanskrit from the *Śrāvakabhūmi* is given because it was consulted when preparing the translation and notes. The twenty items given in the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* are virtually identical. The texts of the corresponding sections of the *Sūtrakhaṇḍasāta* and *Arthavistara* are given in n. 1 of the critical edition of the Tibetan text. The Tibetan translation of the sūtra passages quoted by Guṇamati sometimes differs from the Tibetan translation of the *Vyākhyāyukti*, but these differences have not been noted unless they provide different readings of some importance.
- 8 Based on the *Arthavistara*, although the Tibetan translation matches the *Vyākhyāyukti* more closely than do the Chinese translations. A comparison of the *Arthavistara* with the *Pufayi jing* would suggest that the items listed in the latter differ somewhat.
ŚrBh I, 224.1–5:
tām ca punaḥ kathāṃ (1) kālena karoti, (2) (3) satkṛtyānupūrvam (4) anusaṃdham (5) anusahitaṃ (6) harṣayan (7) rocyan (8) toṣayann (9) utsāhayann (10) anavasādayaṃś ca (11) yuktāṃ (12) sahitāṃ (13) avyavakīrṇāṃ (14) dhārmikīṃ (15) yathāparṣan (16) maitracitto (17) hitacitto (18) ’nukampācitto (19) ’niśrito lābhasatkāraśloke (20) na cātmānam utkarṣayati, na parān paṃsayati/ (evaṃ dharmadeśako bhavati/)
- 9 *ka tya’i bu mo smyug ma can*: Skilling (2000: 347) notes only “Cf. Mvy 3798 smyug ma mkhan = veṇukāra,” but the source of this reference is SN 35.133 (SN IV.121f.), SA 253 (T2.61b): Verahaccānigottā. Akanuma (756b) posits Vairakātyānigotrā as the Sanskrit equivalent of the Pāli, but according to Chung (2008) the Sanskrit equivalent is Veṇukātyāyanasagotrī. Chung also provides details of textual sources. It is recorded that when Veṇukātyāyanasagotrī asked the elder Udāyin to instruct her in the Dharma, initially she was lacking in good manners, sitting, for example, on a high seat, and so Udāyin left without instructing her; it was only later when she modified her behaviour that he agreed to instruct her.
- 10 *mchong ba*: Lee has *mchod pa* ‘to honour’, but all editions have *mchong ba* ‘to leap, pounce’. This analogy refers to the fact that a lion brings all its strength into play even when pouncing on a small animal. As an example, Tokiwa Daijō 常盤大定, ed., *Bukkyō yōten* 仏教要典 (Tokyo: Hakubunkan 博文館, 1933), p. 974, cites the *Gaṇḍavyūha* 12.
- 11 This refers to the “graduated teachings” about almsgiving, observance of moral precepts, and rebirth in a blessed state as reward for good deeds.

- 12 *dus sngar bya ba*: **pūrvakālakaraṇīya*. This term appears in the *Śrāvakabhūmi*, where it is immediately followed by a discussion of the graduated teachings and the four realities for *āryas* (ŚrBh I: 222–223). These two are also explained in the interpretation of sūtra 99 in chapter 2 of the *Vyākhyāyukti* (Lee 2001: 152–155).
- 13 *yang dag phul can*: **sāmutkarṣikī* (cf. BHSD). This refers to discourse on the four realities for *āryas*. In the interpretation of sūtra 99 it is stated that “‘excellent’ is talk of the realities for *āryas*” (VyY, D84a4 [Lee 2001: 154]: ‘*phags pa’i bden pa’i gdam ni yang dag phul can te*).
- 14 Guṇamati comments: “It is for interpreting the sūtras. There are, moreover, two kinds of connections: the connection between the foregoing and subsequent meaning and the connection in the order before and after. These two are also explained later by the Master (Vasubandhu).” These two kinds of connections are discussed in detail in chapter 3 of the *Vyākhyāyukti*. The location of Guṇamati’s commentary on sūtras 62 & 63 is: VyYT, D 207a3–, P 78a5–.
- 15 *dri ba lung bstan pa*: **paripṛcchāvyākaraṇa*.
- 16 Guṇamati explains the “four answers” with reference to the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya* (AKBh, 292ff., ad AK V.22), explaining how an answer is given after having made the question clearer. Guṇamati’s explanation reads as follows: “(1) If asked, ‘Do all beings die?’ one should answer definitively that they do die (= categorical answer). (2) If asked, ‘Are all those who die [re] born [after death]?’ one should answer differentiatingly, saying that those who have mental afflictions are [re]born and those who do not have mental afflictions are not [re]born (= differentiating answer). (3) If asked, ‘Is the human [realm] inferior or superior?’ one should answer by asking, ‘In regard to what (i.e., in comparison with what) did you ask?’ (= counterquestion). If it is [in comparison] with gods, one should answer, ‘Inferior.’ If it is [in comparison] with evil realms of existence, one should answer, ‘Superior.’ (4) If asked, ‘Are beings different from the [five] aggregates or not?’ one rejects [the question] because beings have no substance (= answer by rejection), like the two [questions] about whether a barren woman’s son is white or black.”
- 17 *sngar gnas pa*: someone who has no prior knowledge of Buddhism?
- 18 There are some interesting variants for (9). First, the negative particle *mi* is absent in the *Sūtrakhaṇḍasāta* but is present in the *Vyākhyāyukti* and Guṇamati’s commentary. In the case of the *Arthavistara*, the Tibetan translation has *spro ba dang*, while the *Guangyi famen jing* has *zhengqin* 正勤, and neither has a negative. The corresponding word in the *Pufayi jing* is, judging from the context, presumably *chucan* 除慚, and since *mo* 莫 is generally used as the negative particle in this text, there would seem to be no negative here either. Likewise, the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* and *Śrāvakabhūmi* have *utsāhayatā* and *utsāhayann* respectively, and there is again no negative. However, the *Bodhisattvabhūmi-vyākhyā*, which would seem to have taken the *Vyākhyāyukti* into account, has the negative form (BBhVy, Yi 127b3–4: *spro bar mi byed pa*; I have pointed out previously [Horiuchi 2009] that the *Vyākhyāyukti* is quoted elsewhere in the *Bodhisattvabhūmi-vyākhyā*, and in the present instance the twenty items listed in the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* have been interpreted with reference to the interpretation given in the *Vyākhyāyukti*).

If there was thus no negative in the original text or in corresponding passages in other texts, this means that the version transmitted by Vasubandhu had a negative or (less likely) that Vasubandhu may have added the negative when writing his commentary. Worth noting in this regard is Guṇamati’s commentary. When commenting on the passage in question, he quotes the following sūtra passage: “Praise and also censure are to be known. Knowing praise and also censure, one should neither praise nor should one censure.” In the Pāli *Araṇavibhaṅga-sutta* (cf. n. 18) we read as follows: “One should know praise and one should know censure, and knowing praise and knowing censure, one should neither praise nor censure and should teach only the Dhamma.” (*Araṇavibhaṅga-suttaṃ*, MN [No. 139], Vol. III, 230.15–17: *ussādanaṃ ca jaññā aparādanaṃ ca jaññā ussādanaṃ ca natvā aparādanaṃ ca natvā n’ ev’ ussādeyya na aparādeyya dhammam eva deseyya*.) This is then further elaborated on, the main point being that “one does not say, ‘All those engaged in the pursuit of enjoyment, which pleasure is linked to sensual desires, low, vulgar, coarse, ignoble, and connected with harm, are beset by pain, by vexation, by despair, and by fever and have entered upon the wrong path.’ Saying, ‘Pursuit [of enjoyment] is a state beset by pain, by vexation, by despair, and by fever, and is the wrong path,’ one teaches only the Dhamma.” (ibid., 232.13–19: “*Ye kāmāpaṭisandhisukkhino somanassānuyogaṃ anuyuttā hīnaṃ gammaṃ pothujjanikaṃ anariyaṃ anattasamhitāṃ, sabbe te sadukkhā sa-upaghātā sa-upāyāsā sa-pariḷāhā micchāpaṭiṇṇā ti*” *na evam āha*. “*Anuyogo ca kho sadukkho eso dhammo sa-upaghāto sa-upāyāso sa-pariḷāho micchāpaṭiṇṇā ti*” *iti vadaṃ dhammam eva deseti*.) The same is also said of “(those who have entered upon) the right path” (*sammāpaṭiṇṇā/sammāpaṭiṇṇā*).

Thus, the meaning of “neither praising nor censuring” is that one neither censures someone engaged in wrong conduct nor praises someone engaged in right conduct, and instead one teaches only the “Dhamma,” explaining what is wrong conduct and what is right conduct. This is perhaps close to our notion of condemning the offence but pitying the offender. Judging

from Vasubandhu's exposition in the *Vyākhyāyukti*, the gist of this is that since no one other than the Buddha is able to judge who, in their innermost thoughts, is engaged in right or wrong conduct (i.e., the particularities of those to be instructed), one should neither praise nor censure someone by saying that his conduct is right or wrong.

In view of the links between the *Yogācārabhūmi* and Vasubandhu that have been clarified in recent years, it would seem that Vasubandhu was well acquainted with the content of the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* and *Śrāvakaḥbhūmi*, and judging from the above circumstances, it could be said that, basing himself on the intent of the *Araṇavibhaṅga-sutta*, he interpreted (9) as if it were accompanied by a negative particle. Alternatively, at some stage there may have emerged a tradition in which the negative was added.

- 19 *nyon mongs pa med pa'i mdo*: As has been pointed out by Skilling (2000: 340), the corresponding Pāli text is MN 139, *Araṇavibhaṅga-sutta* (MA 169).
- 20 *snying na ba*: Negi gives *snying na bar byed pa* as a translation of *hṛdayaṇidāhanī*. As mentioned in n. 17, in the *Bodhisattvabhūmi-vyākhyā*, as in the *Vyākhyāyukti*, (9) is accompanied by a negative particle, and its interpretation is modelled on that of the *Vyākhyāyukti*. In the present instance it has "giving rise to anger" (BBhVy, D Yi 127b3: *khong khro ba skye bar 'gyur ba*).
- 21 *tshad ma*: **pramāṇa*. Guṇamati refers to the three means of valid cognition (direct perception, inference, and scripture), and these are also mentioned in chapter 3 of the *Vyākhyāyukti*.
- 22 *gzhan yang*: This sentence merely gives another interpretation of (16)–(18) from a different viewpoint: one should speak to those facing what is good with a mind of loving-kindness, to those facing what is not good with a mind of beneficence, and to those facing neither with a mind of compassion. There is no need to treat this as a separate section as Lee (2001) does. Further, because Lee combines (10) *mi smad pa* with the immediately foregoing (9) *spro ba mi bskyed pa* and counts them as a single item, his numbering hereafter is inappropriate.
- 23 *tha mal pa dag*: Various Sanskrit equivalents can be posited, but here I take it to correspond to **udāsīna*. Negi, s.v. *tha mal pa*, cites a passage in which it is stated that compassion (*karuṇā*) works on those who are neither (*udāsīna*) and those who are hostile.
- 24 *lhag par yid ches pa*.
- 25 *lnga lnga dag gis*: Vasubandhu interprets the twenty ways of speaking listed in the sūtra passage as consisting of four groups of five items each which explain how to speak from four different angles.
- 26 *don 'thad pa med pa*: According to Guṇamati, the remedy for this is (11) "according to reason."
- 27 *mi 'tsham par*: According to Guṇamati, the remedy for this is to speak (15) "just like the assembly," and I have accordingly understood this to mean saying something "inappropriate" in the sense of its being unsuited to the listener. Vasubandhu does not explain to which of the twenty ways of speaking faults [8]–[10] correspond, but according to Guṇamati, they correspond to (13) "unmixedly," (14) "according to the Dharma," and (15) "just like the assembly," respectively.
- 28 *nyon mongs pa can gyi bsams/bsam*: Lee (2001) opts for *bsams*, but in the subsequent explanation of this term all editions have *bsam*, which is also supported by Guṇamati's commentary, and I have accordingly followed the reading *bsam*.
- 29 The "three ways" presumably refer to (3) "in order," (4) "in connection," and (5) "consistently," which are here interpreted as concerning teaching, words of argument, and words of reply, respectively.
- 30 Cf. AKBh, *zhe 'gras dang bar mar gnas pa, pratihata-madhyasthāna* (according to *Abidatsuma kusharon sakuin* 阿毘達磨俱舍論索引 [*Index to the Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*], pt. 3).
- 31 This means that one should not speak of "that which is not the field [of discourse]," i.e., the profound meaning, to someone of inferior capacity. According to Guṇamati, the remedy for this is (12) "together."
- 32 According to Guṇamati, the remedy for this is (19) "not relying on gain, respect, or fame."
- 33 According to Guṇamati, the remedy for this is (20) "neither praising himself nor belittling others."
- 34 According to Guṇamati, "the first [thought]" refers to (i) "thoughts of being trusted," the remedy for which is said to be (16)–(18).
- 35 According to Guṇamati, the mind that seeks to make someone understand *nirvāṇa* is the mind of loving-kindness, the mind that seeks to make someone understand the path to *nirvāṇa* is the mind of beneficence, and the mind that seeks to make someone understand the meaning of what has been explained is the mind of compassion.
- 36 *bskyod pa*: This refers perhaps to a situation in which the speaker is coerced into giving a talk. See also n. 39.
- 37 *snying na ba*: This probably refers to taking offence at being addressed from a standpoint that differs from one's own beliefs and religious affiliation.
- 38 *sun ci phyin du brgal ba*: Lee (2001), following DC, opts for *sun phyin ci log*, but here the form *sun ci phyin*, following P, etc., is

preferable. This is also the form found in all editions of Guṇamati's commentary. Cf. Negi: *sun ci phyin du rgol ba, vitaṇḍā* (captious objection).

- 39 *nang du yang 'jog*: Negi cites *pratisaṃlayana* (withdrawing [for meditation]), etc., as Sanskrit equivalents. According to Guṇamati, the subject here is the speaker. In this connection it is worth noting that BHSD, s.v. *pratisaṃlayana*, cites the following example from the *Lalitavistara* (S. Lefmann ed., 1902), 161.9–10: *ayaṃ kālo dharmadeśanāya, ayaṃ kālāḥ pratisaṃlayanasya*. Judging from the context, *pratisaṃlayana* can be understood to be opposite in meaning to *dharmadeśanā*, and so it means “withdrawing” in the sense that the speaker is not yet ready to speak or has not yet come out to speak. In point of fact, Guṇamati cites here the earlier sūtra about Ka tya'i bu mo smyug ma can (Veṇukātyāyanasagotrī), in which the elder Udāyin, saying that now was not the time, refused to expound the Dharma to someone whose behaviour was inappropriate for listening to the Dharma.
- 40 In the *Bodhisattvabhūmi-vyākhyā*, this is the fault of not paying attention on the grounds that the speaker is a spiritual friend (**kalyāṇamitra*) (D Yi 125a4).
- 41 *chos smra ba la*: Paying attention to the faults of the speaker.
- 42 Faults [7] and [8] have been divided into four separate faults for the purposes of explication.
- 43 '*dun pa*: According to Guṇamati, “desire is by wishing to act” ('*dun pa ni byed par 'dod pa nyid kyis so*//). Cf. AKBh, 54.21: *chandaḥ kartukāmatā*; AKBh(t), '*dun pa ni byed 'dod pa'o*//.
- 44 '*jug pa*: According to Guṇamati, “mental effort is paying attention” ('*jug pa ni yid la byed pa'o*//). Cf. AKBh, *manaskāraś cetaḥ ābhogaḥ*, AKBh(t): *yid la byed pa ni sems kyī 'jug pa'o*//. Along with n. 42, see also Saitō et al. 2011: 57–58, 65–66.
- 45 According to Guṇamati, the remedies for these are (1)–(3) respectively. Vasubandhu does not comment on faults [2] and [3], but according to Guṇamati, the remedies are (4) and (5) respectively.
- 46 According to Guṇamati, the remedies for these five kinds of faults are (7)–(11) respectively.
- 47 The Dharma is Buddhism, which brings about deliverance from transmigration, and because it is in this case conversely understood as not leading to deliverance, this is deemed to be incongruous (*mi mthun pa*).
- 48 According to Guṇamati, the remedies for these five kinds of faults are (12)–(16) respectively.

Text: *Vyākhyāyukti* Ch.II. Sū (62)–(63)

(D 63a5–, C shi 65a6–, P si 74a2–, G si 91b2–, N si 67a6–)

Sū(62)

rnam pa nyi shu po 'di dag dang ldan pas gtam bya'o¹
zhes bya ba ni mdo sde'i dum bu'o//

- [1] de la (1) dus su zhes bya ba ni nyan 'dod pa nyid dang bshad pa'i 'os su gyur pa nyid du shes nas te/ ka tya'i bu² mo smyug ma can bzhin no// (2) bsgrim pa³ zhes bya ba ni brnyas pa med pa ste/ seng ge mchong ba⁴ bzhin no// (3) go rims⁵ zhes bya ba ni dus (**C65b**) sngar bya ba sbyin pa la sogs pa dang/ yang dag phul can gyi gtam las brtsams nas so// (4) mtshams sbyar ba zhes bya ba ni mdo sde⁶ rnam par bshad pa las brtsams (**N67b**) nas so// (5) rjes su mthun pa zhes bya ba ni dri⁷ ba lung bstan pa las brtsams nas te/ mgo gcig tu lung bstan pa la sogs pa rnams la de bzhin du lung ston pa'i phyir ro// (6) dga' bar bya ba ni dad pa can rnams la'o// (7) 'dod par bya ba ni sngar gnas pa dang zhe 'gras pa rnams la'o// (8) mgu bar bya ba ni the tshom can rnams la'o//⁸ (9) spro ba mi bskyed pa dang (**D63b**) (10) mi smad pa ni gang su dag 'di 'dra ba thams cad ni yang dag pa la zhugs pa dag go zhe 'am/ log pa la zhugs pa dag go zhes bya ba lta bu ste/ ji skad du **nyon mongs** (**G92a**) pa med pa'i mdo las gsungs pa lta bu ste/ ⁹gdul ba'i¹⁰ khyad par mngon par mi shes pa de lta bur byed pa ni des gdul ba ma yin pa rnams snying na bar (**P74b**) 'gyur ro//
- (11) rigs ^[11]pa ni tshad ma dang mi 'gal ba'i phyir ro// (12) 'brei pa ni snga phyi 'brei pa'i phyir ro// (13) ma 'dres pa ni gtam gzhan du 'phro ba spangs pa'i phyir ro// (14) chos dang ldan pa ni dge ba dang mthun pa'i phyir ro// (15) 'khori ji lta ba bzhin ni gdul ba dang 'tsham pa'i phyir ro//
- (16) byams pa'i sems ni nyan pa po bde bar smon¹² pas so// (17) phan pa'i sems ni de la nyon mongs pa med par smon¹³ pas so// (18) snying brtse ba'i sems ni de la sdug bsngal med par smon¹⁴ pas so// (16'–18') gzhan yang dge ba dang mi dge ba la phyogs¹⁵ pa dang/ tha mal pa dag la byams pa la sogs pa'i sems kyis¹⁶ te go rims¹⁷ bzhin no// (19) rnyed pa dang bkur sti dang¹⁸ tshigs su bcad pa la¹⁹ mi brten²⁰ pa ni de 'dod pa nyid spangs pas so// (20) bdag la bstod par mi bya zhing gzhan la smad par mi bya ba ni smra ba po nyid kyis²¹ bdag la lhag par yid ches par byed 'dod pa nyid spangs pas so//
- de lta na ji lta bur dang/ gang gi don du dang/ gang 'dra ba dang/ gang 'dra bas gtam bya ba de lnga lnga dag gis yongs su bstan to//

[II] **lung** las ni

skyon bcu gcig gi gnyen por gtam rnam pa nyi shu dang ldan pa'o²²

zhes 'byung ngo// (C66a)

skyon bcu gcig ni [1] snod ma yin pa la (N68a) brjod pa'i skyon dang/ [2] brjod (G92b) pa yongs su ma rdzogs pa'i skyon dang/ [3] brjod pa bar chad pa'i skyon dang/ [4] brjod pa go bar mi byed pa'i skyon dang/ [5] brjod pa mchod par mi 'gyur ba'i skyon dang/ [6] don 'thad pa med par brjod pa'i skyon dang/ [7] spyod yul ma yin pa brjod pa'i²³ skyon dang/ [8] rnam par g-yengs nas brjod pa'i skyon dang/ [9] don med pa dang ldan pa brjod pa'i skyon dang/ (P75a) [10] mi 'tsham par brjod pa'i skyon dang/ [11] nyon mongs pa can gyi bsam²⁴ pas brjod pa'i skyon no//

de la [1'] snod ma yin pa ni spyod lam mi sdug par 'dug pa'o// [3'] brjod pa bar chad pa'i skyon gyi gnyen por ni go rims²⁵ la sogs pa rnam pa gsum po dag yin par rig par bya ste/ bstan pa dang/ rgol ba'i tshig dang/ lan gyi tshig gis dbang du mdzad nas so// [4'] brjod pa go bar mi byed pa'i skyon gyi gnyen por drug pa dang/ bdun pa dang/ brgyad pa dag ste/ dad pa can dang/ zhe 'gras pa dang/ bar na gnas pa'i dbang du mdzad nas so// [5'] brjod pa mchod par mi 'gyur ba'i skyon gyi gnyen por dgu pa dang bcu pa gnyis te/ sdig pa'i las can la ni spro ba bskyed par 'os pa ma yin la/smad na yang mchod par mi 'gyur ba'i skyon du 'gyur bas so// [7'] spyod yul ma yin pas ni don zab²⁶ mo ste/ dbang po tha ma la'o// [11'] nyon mongs pa can gyi bsam pa ni rnam pa gsum ste/ [i] yid ches par bya ba'i bsam pa dang/ [ii] dad nas bkur sti²⁷ byed pa'i bsam pa dang/ [iii] phrag dog gi bsam pa'o// [i'] dang po'i gnyen por byams (G93a) pa dang/ phan pa dang/ snying brtse ba'i sems kyi rnam pa dag ste/ mya ngan las 'das pa dang/ de'i lam rtogs par bya ba'i bsam pa nyid dang/ bshad pa'i don khong²⁸ du chud par bya ba'i bsam pa nyid kyi so//

[III] gzhan yang mdor na 'di las gtam gyi sbyor ba dang/ gtam gyi las dang/ (C66b) gtam gyi yon tan dang/ smra ba po'i yon²⁹ tan las brtsams nas rnam pa lnga lnga dag tu (N68b) rig par bya'o// (bam po bzhi pa//)

Sū (63) (D 64a6-65a3, C66b1-67a6, P 75a8-76a8, G si 93a3-94a4, N si 68b1-69a5)

rnam pa bcu drug po 'di dag dang ldan pas (P75b) chos mnyam par bya'o³⁰

zhes bya ba ni mdo sde'i dum bu'o//

[I] de la rnam pa bcu drug po dag ni skyon rnam pa bcu gsum gyi gnyen po yin par rig par bya'o//

skyon rnam pa bcu gsum ni (1) smra ba po la bdag nyid kyi bskyod pa dang spyod lam gyi skyon dang/ (2) 'gying ba'i skyon dang/ (3) don du mi gnyer ba'i skyon dang/ (4) gzhan gyi phyogs byed pas snying³¹ na ba'i skyon dang/ (5) mchod par mi 'gyur bas smra ba po rab tu mi 'dzin pa'i skyon dang/ (6) sun ci phyin³² du brgal ba'i bsam pa'i skyon dang/ (7) chos dang chos smra ba la yid la mi byed pa'i phyir rim gro mi byed pa'i skyon dang/ (8) skyon yid la byed pa'i phyir brnyas³³ pa'i skyon dang/ (9) smod³⁴ pa'i skyon dang/ (10) rnyed pa dang bkur³⁵ sti 'dod pa nyid kyi skyon dang/ (11) rnam par g-yengs pa dang bsdus pa gnyis kyi³⁶ mi nyan pa'i skyon dang/ (12) legs³⁷ par yid la mi byed pa'i skyon dang/ (13) rab tu yid la (G93b) mi byed pa'i skyon dang/

de la nang du yang dag³⁸ 'jog pa'i tshe spyod lam gyi mi sdug pa'i phyir skyon dang po yin no// rigs mthon po nyid la sogs par nga rgyal 'byung ba'i phyir 'gying ba'i skyon no³⁹// chos la ni yon tan dang legs par gsungs pa dang 'bras bu chen po nyid du 'o// chos smra ba la ni dge ba'i bshes gnyen nyid du'o// chos la skyon ni tshig dang yig 'bru ma 'brel pa nyid du'o// chos smra ba la ni tshul khirms dang/ rigs dang/ byad gzugs dang/ tshig dang/ tshig 'byin pa ma tshang ba nyid du'o// rnam par g-yengs pa ni sems⁴⁰ gzhan du 'phros pa'o// bsdus pa ni rmugs pa dang/ gnyid kyi sems zhun pa nyid du'o⁴¹// legs par yid la mi byed pa ni dgongs pa dang chos nyid la phyin ci log (D76a) pa nyid kyi so// rab tu yid la mi byed pa ni 'dun pa dang 'jug pa zhan⁴² pa nyid kyi so// (C67a)

[II] **lung** las ni

skyon rnam pa drug gi gnyen por rnam pa bcu drug dag yin no

zhes 'byung ste/

skyon drug⁴³ ni [1] las kyi skyon (N69a) dang/ [2] mos pa med pa'i skyon dang/ [3] mchod par mi 'gyur ba'i skyon dang/ [4] bsam pa'i skyon dang/ [5] mi mthun pa nyid kyi skyon dang/ [6] 'dzin pa'i skyon no//

de la [1'] las kyi skyon ni rnam pa gsum ste/ (i) lus kyi las kyi skyon ni spyod lam mi sdug⁴⁴ par 'dug pa'i phyir ro// (ii) lus dang ngag gi skyon ni de gnyis kyi skul bar mi byed pa'i phyir ro// (iii) yid kyi las kyi skyon ni nyan par⁴⁵ mi 'dod pa (G94a) nyid kyi so// [4'] bsam pa'i skyon ni gzhan la klan ka btsal ba dang/ 'di lta bu zhih tu rgol ba las thar bar bya ba'i bsam pa nyid kyi so// [5'] mi mthun pa nyid kyi skyon ni rnam pa lnga dag ste/ (i) ~ (ii) de la chos la ni nges bar 'byin pa ma yin par go ba nyid kyi gus pa med pa dang/ tshig dang yi ge ma 'brel⁴⁶ pa nyid kyi brnyas pa'o// (iii) ~ (iv) gang zag la ni tshul khirms dang/ tshig dang/ tshig 'byin pa'i skyon gyis gus pa med pa dang/ rigs kyi skyon gyis brnyas pa'o// (v) khong du chud pa dang sgrub⁴⁷ pa'i nus pa mi 'byung snyam pa'i bdag nyid la brnyas pa'o// [6'] 'dzin pa'i skyon yang rnam pa lnga

ste/ (i) log par 'dzin pa dang/ (ii) don mi 'dzin⁴⁸ pa dang/ (iii) tshig 'bru mi 'dzin pa dang/ (iv) brda ma sprad par 'dzin pa dang/ (v) ma lus par mi 'dzin pa'o//
lhag ma ni go sla ba'i phyir rnam par ma phye'o//

- 1 『広義法門經』(T1. 919c9-15): 長老。能說比丘, 若欲為他說於正法与法及義相應, 此語應說。謂恭敬, 次第, 相撰, 相應, 生他歡喜, 及以欲樂, 滿足, 正勤, 不損惱他, 所說如理, 相應, 無雜, 隨順聽衆。此言應說: 有慈悲心, 有利益心, 有隨樂心, 不著利養, 恭敬, 讚歎, 若正說法陰時, 不得自讚自高, 不得毀訾他人。

*Whereas the *Guangyi famen jing* gives the number “sixteen” when enumerating the ways of listening, it does not give the number “twenty” when listing the ways of speaking. However, it tallies by and large with the gist of the other related texts. 『普法義經』(T1.922b20-29): 若經欲說異人者, 當為是二十品說。何等為二十。一為善說。二為多說。三為前後說。四為次第說。五為歡喜說。六為可說。七為解意說。八為除慚說。九當為莫訶失說。十為調說。十一為應說。十二為莫散說。十三為法說。十四為隨衆說。十五為等意說。十六為助護意說。十七為莫窮名聞故說。十八為莫利事故說。十九為莫從說自現。二十莫從說調余。若賢者比丘, 欲為余人說, 當為是二十品說。

Arthvi, D sa 188b6-189a1, P šu 198a4-:

tshe dang ldan pa dag smra ba'i dge slong gtam smra bas gzhan dag la rnam pa nyi shus gtam bya ste/ 'di lta ste/ (1) dus su dang (2) gus pa dang/ (3) 'tsham pa (4) mtshams 'byor ba dang (5) rjes su 'brel (P 'bral) pa dang (6) ri mo dang/ (7) 'dod pa dang (8) mgu ba dang (9) spro ba dang (10) mi smod pa dang (11) rigs pa dang (12) 'brel pa dang (13) ma 'chol (P 'tshol) ba dang [(14) chos dang ldan pa?, DP om.] (15) ji lta ba bzhin gyi (P om. gyi) sems dang (16) phan pa dang/ (17) phan pa'i sems dang (18) snying brtse ba'i sems dang (19) rnyed pa dang bkur sti dang tshigs su bcad pa la mi brten (P rten) par bya'o// gtam de dag smra ba na (20) bdag la bstod par mi bya/ gzhan la smod par mi bya bar gtam bya'o//

*Although the *Arthavistara* gives the number of ways of speaking as “twenty,” they are not neatly divided into twenty items. Were one to make modifications with reference to the various editions so as to arrive at twenty items, one might add *chos dang ldan pa* as (14) and emend (16) *phan pa* to *byams pa*. Alternatively, instead of adding (14), (20) could perhaps be divided into two to give twenty items..

Sūśa, D shi 23a3-6:

tshe dang ldan pa dag dge slong chos smra ba bos (VyYT sgrogs pas) chos kyi gtam byed pa na rnam pa nyi shu po 'di dag dang ldan pas gtam bya ste/ (1) dus su dang/ (2) gus pa dang/ (3) go rims dang/ (4) 'tshams sbyar ba dang/ (5) rjes su mthun pa dang/ (6) dga' bar bya ba dang/ (7) 'dod par bya ba dang/ (8) mgu bar bya ba dang/ (9) spro ba mi (VyYT om. mi) skyed pa dang/ (10) mi smad pa dang/ (11) rigs pa dang/ (12) 'brel pa dang/ (13) ma 'dres pa dang/ (14) chos dang ldan pa dang/ (15) 'khor ji lta ba bzhin dang/ (16) byams pa'i sems dang/ (17) phan pa'i sems dang/ (18) snying brtse ba'i sems dang/ (19) rnyed pa dang/ bkur sti dang tshigs su bcad pa la mi rten pa dang/ (20) gtam de dag brjod pa na bdag la bstod par mi bya zhing gzhan la smad par mi bya la gtam yang bya ba ste/ rnam pa nyi shu po 'di dag dang ldan pas gtam bya'o

- 2 PGN nu
3 Sūśa: gus pa
4 DPGN mchong ba, CL mchod pa
5 PG rim
6 G sde'i
7 PGN 'dri
8 D om. mgu bar ~ rnam la'o//
9 C bu'o//
10 PGN bar
11 PGN rig
12 PGN smos
13 PGN smos
14 PGN smon
15 DC sog; cf. VyYT: phyogs
16 PGN kyi
17 PGN rim
18 PGN om. dang

- 19 PGN om. la
- 20 N bnyen
- 21 PGN kyi
- 22 DPGN pa
- 23 C pa ji
- 24 CL bsams
- 25 PGN rim
- 26 PGN bzang
- 27 C ste
- 28 PGN om. khong
- 29 P yo

30 Cf. Arthvi, D 189a1-4, P 198a7-198b1:

tshe dang ldan pa dag chos nyan par 'dod pas rnam pa bcu drug gis mnyan par bya ste/ 'di lta ste/ (1) dus su chos mnyan par bya ba dang/ (2) bkur stir bya ba dang/ (3) gus par nyan pa dang/ (4) ma rangs pa med pa dang/ (5) bsgo ba bzhin nyan pa dang/ (6) klan ka mi tshol ba dang/ (7) chos la gus par bya ba dang/ (8) chos smra ba'i gang zag la gus par bya ba dang/ (9) chos la mi brnyas pa dang/ (10) chos smra ba'i gang zag la mi brnyas pa dang/ (11) bdag la mi brnyas pa dang/ (12) rtse gcig pa'i sems dang/ (13) kun shes par bya ba'i sems dang/ (14) rna (D ins. ba) blags te mnyan pa dang/ (15) sems bsdu te (16) sems thams cad kyis bsams te chos (D ins. la) mnyan par bya'o//

Sūśa, D shi 23a6-23b2:

tshe dang ldan pa dag chos mnyan par 'dod pas ni/ rnam pa bcu drug dag dang ldan pas chos mnyan par bya ste/ (1) dus su chos mnyan par bya ba dang/ (2) gus pa dang/ (3) nyan par gus pa dang/ (4) ma rangs pa med pa dang/ (5) bsgo ba bzhin byed pa dang/ (6) klan ka mi tshol ba dang/ (7) chos la gus pa nye bar (D24b) gzhag pa dang/ (8) gang zag chos smra ba la gus pa nye bar gzhag pa dang/ (9) chos la brnyas pa med pa nyid dang/ (10) gang zag chos smra ba la brnyas pa med pa nyid dang/ (11) bdag nyid la brnyas pa med pa nyid dang/ (12) kun tu shes par bya ba'i sems dang/ (13) sems rtse gcig tu bya ba dang/ (14) rna blags pa dang/ (15) sems kun tu btud pa dang/ (16) sems thams cad kyis bsams nas chos mnyan par bya ste/ tshe dang ldan pa dag rnam pa bcu drug po 'di dag dang ldan pas chos mnyan par bya'o

zhes bya ba ni mdo sde'i dum bu yin no//

*In the *Arthavistara* and *Sūtrakhaṇḍasāta* the order of (12) and (13) has been reversed.

『広義法門經』(T1.919c15-22): 長老。若人欲聽正法，具十六相，乃可聽受。何等十六。一隨時聽，二恭敬，三欲棄，四無執著，五如聞隨行，六不為破難，七於法起尊重心，八於說者起尊重心，九不輕撥正法，十不輕撥說者，十一不輕己身，十二一心不散，十三欲求解心，十四一心諦聽，十五依理正思，十六憶持前後，而聽正法。

『普法義經』(T1.922c1-8): 舍利弗復謂比丘。欲聞法者，當有十六業。何等為十六。一當為有時可聞，二當為多聞，三當為向耳聽，四當為事，五當為莫平訶，六當為莫訶失，七當為莫求長短，八當為法恭敬，九當為說法者恭敬，十當為莫易法，十一亦莫易說法者，十二亦莫自易身，十三一向心，十四莫余意，十五正持心，十六覺一切念，可聞法正。

BBh, (Ch.VIII.balagotra), 104.17-105.9:

sa evaṃ upasaṃkramaṇasampannaḥ asaṃkṣiptaś ca dharmam śṛṇoty avikṣiptaś ca/ katham asaṃkṣiptaḥ śṛṇoti/ staṃbhasaṃkleśavigato 'vamanyanāsaṃkleśavigataḥ layasaṃkleśavigataś ca/

tatra ṣaḍbhir ākāraiḥ staṃbhasaṃkleśavigato bhavati/ caturbhir ākāir avamanyanāsaṃkleśavigato bhavati/ekena ākāreṇa layasaṃkleśavigato bhavati/ (1) kālena śṛṇoti (2) satkṛtya (3) śuśrūṣamāṇo (4) na asūyann (5) anuvīdhīyamāṇaḥ (6) anupāraṃbhaprekṣi/ebhiḥ ṣaḍbhir ākāraiḥ staṃbhasaṃkleśavigataḥ/ (7) dharme gauravam upasthāpya (8) dharmabhāṇake pudgale gauravam upasthāpya (9) dharmam aparibhavaṃ (10) dharmabhāṇakam pudgalaṃ aparibhavan ebhiś caturbhir ākāir avamanyanāsaṃkleśavigataḥ śṛṇoti/ (11) ātmānam aparibhavaṃ śṛṇoti/ anena ekena ākāreṇa layasaṃkleśavigataḥ śṛṇoti/ evaṃ hi bodhisattvaḥ asaṃkṣipto dharmam śṛṇoti/ tatra katham bodhisattvaḥ avikṣipto dharmam śṛṇoti/ paṃcabhir ākāraiḥ/ (12) ājñācitta (13) ekāgracittaḥ (14) avahitaśrotraḥ (15) samāvarjitamānasaḥ (16) sarvacetasā samanvāhṛtya dharmam śṛṇoti/ evaṃ hi bodhisattvaḥ śrutaṃ paryeṣate/ (In the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* the sixteen ways of listening are broadly divided into (A) listening without mental afflictions and (B) listening undistractedly. In the case of (A), listening without mental afflictions, "mental afflictions" are equated with rigidity, contempt, and depression. The ways of listening without these three kinds of mental afflictions are deemed to be (1)–(6), (7)–(10), and (11) respectively. (B), listening undistractedly, is equated with the remaining five ways of listening [(12)–(16)].)

- 31 C snyeng
- 32 PGN sun ci phyin, DCL sun phyin ci log

- 33 PGN bsnyas
- 34 C smon, P smrad
- 35 P mkur, N bskur
- 36 PGN kyi
- 37 PGN len
- 38 PGN om. dag
- 39 C dang
- 40 P sams
- 41 PGN do
- 42 C zhen, L nyan
- 43 PGN ins. dag
- 44 N btsug
- 45 DC nyan par, PGN nye bar
- 46 ma 'brel, L mang brel
- 47 N bsgrub
- 48 mi 'dzin; L ming dzin